R evista de Antropología, Ciencias de la Comunicación y de la Información, Filosofía, Lingüística y Semiótica, Problemas del Desarrollo, la Ciencia y la Tecnología 

Año 36, 2020, Especial Nº

Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales ISSN 1012-1537/ ISSNe: 2477-9335 Depósito Legal pp 193402ZU45



Universidad del Zulia Facultad Experimental de Ciencias Departamento de Ciencias Humanas Maracaibo - Venezuela

# **Inclusive education: A path to equal rights**

Galina A. Romanova<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Academy of social management, Moscow, Russian Federation <u>ga romanowa@asou-mo.ru</u>

Vladimir M. Ananishnev<sup>2</sup> <sup>2</sup>Moscow City University, Moscow, Russian Federation <u>AnanishnevV@mpgu.su</u>

Ekaterina S. Darda<sup>3</sup>

<sup>3</sup>Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, Moscow, Russian Federation <u>esdarda@rea.ru</u>

# Abstract

The aim of the study is the introduction of inclusive education in order to help students with special educational needs as a path to equal rights via SWOT, PEST and PESTLE analyses. As a result, the number of children with disabilities in underpopulated areas is smaller in countries with low population density than in small densely populated countries. In conclusion, the alternative ways to increase the effectiveness of the inclusive approach to the education system have been proposed based on the extension of distance learning methods and the development of incentive mechanisms for educational process participants.

Keywords: Inclusive, Education, SWOT, Analysis, PEST.

# Educación inclusiva: un camino hacia la igualdad de derechos

# Resumen

El objetivo del estudio es la introducción de la educación inclusiva para ayudar a los estudiantes con necesidades educativas especiales como un camino hacia la igualdad de derechos a través de análisis SWOT, PEST y PESTLE. Como resultado, el número de niños con discapacidades en áreas despobladas es menor en países con baja densidad de población que en países pequeños densamente poblados. En conclusión, se han propuesto formas alternativas para aumentar la efectividad del enfoque inclusivo del sistema educativo basado en la extensión de los métodos de aprendizaje a distancia y el desarrollo de mecanismos de incentivos para los participantes del proceso educativo.

Palabras clave: Inclusivo, Educación, FODA, Análisis, PESTA.

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

Inclusion is the involvement of students with disabilities in the learning process with the help of an educational program that matches their abilities and satisfies individual educational needs. The introduction of inclusive education makes it possible to help students with special educational needs to adapt themselves to the social environment. Educational and social development is associated not only with the abilities of students and their family opportunities but with the capabilities and resources of the educational environment, which includes various components. The inclusion of a student with special educational needs in mass education greatly contributes to the development and self-determination of such a student in modern education.

Any student is a social being who is characterized by the indomitable desire for imitation (GARANINA, BALYAEV & IONOVA, 2019; ROMANOVA, 2017). Thus, personality is formed only in close contact with people whose special qualities liaison

between a person and the world. According to the International Commission on Education of the 21st Century report to UNESCO, learning to live together is one of the fundamental goals of education. Therefore, the activities of all specialists interacting with students should be aimed at ensuring that students with and without disabilities can communicate, do not separate from each other, but rather help and sympathize with each other so that they feel comfortable and confident within the walls of an educational institution.

The Policy Department for Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs conducted a study on the issue of inclusive education for students with disabilities. The study provided an overview of the definitions for and background to inclusive education, as well as of the role of international organizations and the European Union in this matter. The study also examines the situation of inclusive education in the EU countries and the main prospects for the future. The discussions about disability studies can be found in (MILES & SINGAL, 2010; GORDON, 2013; FLORIAN, 2014). The authors address the philosophical issues of the morality of the right to inclusive education. It is also argued that the fundamental human right to inclusive education is of great practical importance for students with disabilities and special educational needs. This is their basic right not to be discriminated in education as it is legally effective. Unfortunately, this particular human right does not have a consensus on the proper moral behavior of all educational process participants.

#### Galina A. Romanova et al. Opción, Año 36, Especial No.26 (2020): 613-628

The inclusive education concept has deviated from the problem of teaching students with disabilities. The focus is on the political, economic, social and technological aspects of the external environment that affect the education policy for students with disabilities. The analysis of inclusive education trends is based on the assessment of the goals and objectives, accessibility, social and economic feasibility of inclusive education systems.

First, university facilities should be fully accessible without any physical barriers. It is crucial to apply universal design principles so that the premises are accessible to all people. Secondly, universities should take into account the sensitive period of adaptation of students with disabilities during the first year and even the first weeks of studies. Educational institutions should help students with special educational needs accelerate their academic success. Strategies may include special introductory classes, study guides or the creation of initiative groups for students with special educational needs. Finally, higher education should support the additional training of teachers. Training and methodological strategies to meet the needs of students with disabilities should be obligatory for all staff. Faculty management should be well-informed about and qualified in inclusive pedagogy and universal design for learning. For example, FLORIAN (2014) introduced the IPAA Framework. The course is designed for experienced teachers trained in the theoretical foundations of the inclusive methodology. It helps them to understand the purpose of inclusion in the educational environment.

The analysis of inclusive education policies in various Anglo-American national and provincial state jurisdictions is presented in (HARDY & WOODCOCKM, 2015). The authors use a widely critical political sociological approach. The results of the study are considered from the perspective of the legal burden, namely additional paperwork and regulatory and control procedures. An ethical component is also considered in the development of inclusive education methods (HASAN, HALDER & DEBNATH, 2018). The work GIBSON (2015) is focused on gender composition in various educational institutions in Australia.

Methods, analysis and literature review, as well as an attempt to create a general chronology of studies on the implementation of inclusive education for 2005 - 2015, can be found in (MESSIOU, 2017). The author presented a detailed analysis of the studies on inclusive education conducted over the past 11 years and published in The International Journal of Inclusive Education. This resource is the only peer-reviewed journal that includes the term inclusive education in its title. At the same time, it is considered a prestigious journal on inclusive and special education. In total, 640 articles were published for the period of 2005–2015.

The author analyzed and classified the material taking into account: a) the topics being discussed; and (b) the types of methodologies used. A number of topics for discussion were identified through the analysis. The largest share of research was focused on specific categories of students: disability (21%), special needs (15%) or a combination of them (3%). Other studies (15%) were devoted to gender and disability, ethnic minorities and disability, etc. The main methodological approaches used in the studies were also analyzed. The main sample included both empirical studies and non-empirical studies. Thus, most studies are based on theoretical works and the analysis of publications (AMOR, HAGIWARA, SHOGREN, THOMPSON, VERDUGO, BURKE & AGUAYO, 2018).

The literature review showed that inclusive education has been actively discussed by researchers over the past 5 years, including summarized publications (ALKHATEEB, HADIDI, & ALKHATEEB, 2016). Today, legal approaches to regulation and adaptation of people with special educational needs to the traditional education system are being developed. Unfortunately, no effective strategies to improve the implementation of an inclusive approach have been proposed. The purpose of our research is to study inclusive approaches as a way to get equitable access to education, as well as to identify factors affecting the effectiveness of inclusive education.

#### 2. METHODOLOGY

In order to assess the state and attractiveness of different education systems for students with disabilities, we applied SWOT, PEST and PESTLE analyses. Let us briefly consider the principles used for the analyses. The object of the SWOT analysis is different points of view on the education of students with disabilities. The SWOT analysis is known as an effective method for the assessment of the current situation in the context of its strengths and weaknesses, as well as associated threats and risks. The principles of the SWOT analysis for inclusive education are described in HONG (2015), as well as in (AGARWAL, GRASSL & PAHL, 2012).

The PEST analysis can be used to identify political, economic, social and technological aspects of the environment affecting the education of children and adults with disabilities. Political and economic aspects are considered due to the fact that they affect the acquisition of key resources to ensure the education of people with disabilities nationwide, as well as the development of the global strategy (AMBAROVA, ZBOROVSKY, & SHABROVA, 2019). However, different attitudes to the education of people with disabilities are most likely consumer preferences. We suppose that incentive-based systems will be more effective than legal pressure.

They are presented using the social component of the PEST analysis. The technological component is also important. It identifies trends in technological support for the development of education of students with disabilities and demonstrates the prospects for introducing new forms of education. The use of these methods allowed us to identify several generalized categories of the analysis (positions). By position, we mean the attitude of the state, society and, in particular, teachers to the education of people with disabilities. The PESTLE analysis is the most common tool for determining macroenvironment factors that can affect the system. It helps to identify and evaluate 6 types of environmental influences: P (Political), E (Economic), S (Socio-Cultural), T (Technological), L (Legal) and E (Environmental). The main goal of the PESTLE analysis is to identify factors that meet two criteria:

- Factors that do not affect the system;
- Internal factors.

In addition, we analyzed the approaches described in detail in (MESSIOU, 2017).

The results of the analyses are presented in Table 1. The following criteria were selected for the PESTLE analysis:

P (Political) – HDI, CPI;

E (Economic) – GDP, nominal value;

S (Socio-Cultural) – special schools, gender equality;

T (Technological) - GDP, nominal value;

620

L (Legal) – CPI;

E (Environmental) – square footage and population density.

HDI stands for the Human Development Index. This is an integral indicator that is calculated to assess the standard of living, literacy, and education level, as well as life expectancy as the main characteristics of the human potential of the given area. It is a common tool for comparing different countries and regions by their standards of living. The index was developed in 1990 by a Pakistani economist Mahbub ul Haq. It has been published as part of the UN Development Program in annual reports on human development since 1990. When calculating the HDI, three indicators are taken into account:

• Life expectancy (longevity);

• Literacy rate of the country's population (mean years of schooling) and expected years of schooling;

• Standard of living estimated through GNI per capita (PPP \$).

CPI is the Corruption Perceptions Index that is published by the international non-governmental organization Transparency International. The indicator ranks countries by their perceptions of corruption in the public sector. It has been calculated annually since 1995. The index is based on several independent surveys. The index is a rating from 0 (maximum level of corruption) to 100 (no corruption).

# **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The analysis of the factors influencing the effective development of inclusive education is given in Table 1; we applied SWOT, PEST and PESTLE analyses. The results were taken from sources.

Country	Population	Total number of students with disabilities %	Special school	Square footage, km <sup>2</sup>	Population density	GDP, the nominal value	anticorruption , CPI	ICH
Poland	38 313 035	3	1.7	312 679	122	16 179	35	0.865
Germany	83 019 200	5	3.7	357 385	227	48 264	11	0.936
Denmark	5 811 413	5	2	43 094	137.2	36 336	1	0.929
Latvia	1 934 379	6	3.5	64 589	29.95	18 472	43	0.847
Estonia	1 324 820	8	3.1	45 227	28	23 514	20	0.871
Norway	5 358 578	8	0.2	385 207	13.91	74 940	7	0.953
Lithuania	2 790 472	12	1.2	65 301	43	19 748	37	0.858
Russia	146 780 720	2.4	1.5	17 125 191	8.56	10 962	136	0.816
Ukraine	41 840 426	2.7	2.6	603 549	72.6	3 220	120	0.751

 Table 1: Analysis of the factors influencing the effective development of inclusive education

HDI – Human Development Index; CPI – Corruption Perceptions Index.

Based on the SWOT and PESTLE analyses, we concluded that those who feel compassion unite in public organizations, receive support and funding from companies and individual citizens, as well as state grants for educating students with disabilities. These expenses are included in the budgets of the states that have higher standards of living (Germany, Denmark, and Norway). For many years, these countries supported inclusive education in primary and secondary schools. A number of major educational projects have been implemented in collaboration with the organizations specializing in teaching a student with special educational needs. In Russia, half of the families that have family members with disabilities do not get sufficient funding and can only afford food and clothing. Low financial status significantly limits the ability to support students.

The weakness of the position of compassion in the modern education system is that increased financial support for children and adults with disabilities in terms of state pensions and benefits does not contribute to their desire for professional education and economic independence. For example, only 25% of the working-age population with disabilities work in Russia and only half of them are involved in local communities and ready to be independent. The authors also note territorial inequality in the accessibility of education. All kinds of special schools can be found only in 8 Russian regions. The share of special schools in the country providing students with special educational needs with unimpeded access to education is only 32.6%.

Table 1 shows that countries have significantly different levels of economic activity. Therefore, the conditions and proposed

mechanisms for the development of inclusive education cannot be identical. Consequently, there is a need for a strategic analysis of the step-by-step development of inclusive education, taking into account regional characteristics and regional systems to meet the educational needs of children with disabilities. It is commonly known that the development of any systemic process requires financial resources. According to Table 1, the number of special schools depends on the economic development of the country. However, the exceptions are also possible. It is economically irrational to construct special schools in developed countries with low population density (for example, in Norway or Latvia).

The importance of the proper organization of classrooms for teaching children with disabilities is emphasized (LJUSBERG, 2011). The data were obtained based on the semi-structured interviews with ten teachers teaching children with attention deficit disorder and the observations they provided. For interaction with children teachers mainly use a specific communication style that takes into account their low concentration and attention. The results of various classroom organization methods and surveys of teachers demonstrate the effectiveness of structured classrooms, where workplaces are separated with privacy desk panels or the seating arrangement takes students' faces to the wall. The learning process requires a clear structure (LJUSBERG, 2011).

Referring to the fact that there are not so many students with disabilities, schools have limited their organization of specially equipped classes. The function of such classes is the integration of children with disabilities into traditional classrooms. We believe that the only thing that children learn when studying in special classes is that they are students of such classes. We suppose that the creation of structured classrooms is not cost-effective for low-income countries. This is explained by the fact that the number of children with disabilities in underpopulated areas is smaller in countries with low population density than in small densely populated countries.

# **4. CONCLUSION**

Based on the research results, we identified the factors that positively and negatively affect the consolidation of inclusive education. As part of our study, we propose alternative ways to increase the effectiveness of the inclusive approach to the education system:

• In primary and secondary education:

a) Creation or expansion of the institutions for children with disabilities encouraged by the opportunity to conduct business activities. For example, compulsory use of alternative power generation systems on the territory of the institution. b) Creation of centers for creativity to replace special schools; shift to the focus on the age groups of students.

c) Creation of mechanisms to encourage and attract patrons by partially removing the tax burden;

• In master programs or higher education programs for students:

a) Focus on the creation of online courses, distance training, the choice of an individual training program, the acquisition of basic computer skills, as well as the development of intramural inclusive education.

b) Encouraging the teaching staff through the opportunity to apply for personal credit lines and partially removed the tax burden according to individual formulas. For example, the basic principles of German inclusive education suggest that it is necessary to train teachers: today German teachers can receive two degrees allowing them to teach in a secondary school, as well as in a special one.

c) Further development and introduction of the worldwide practice of the free movement of teachers with two degrees or certificates.

e) Creation and support of an Internet resource to record the expanded activities of a teacher or an assistant and to form personal and group ratings based on the h-index principle.

#### REFERENCES

- AGARWAL, R., GRASSL, W., & PAHL, J. 2012. "Meta-SWOT: introducing a new strategic planning tool". Journal of Business Strategy. Vol. 33, N° 2: 12-21. UK.
- ALKHATEEB, J., HADIDI, M., & ALKHATEEB, A. 2016. "Inclusion of children with developmental disabilities in Arab countries: A review of the research literature from 1990 to 2014". **Research in developmental disabilities**. Vol. 49, pp. 60-75. UK.
- AMBAROVA, P., ZBOROVSKY, G., & SHABROVA, N. 2019. "Old and New Trust in Higher Education". **The Education and** science journal. Vol. 21, N° 1: 9-36. UK.
- AMOR, A., HAGIWARA, M., SHOGREN, K., THOMPSON, J., VERDUGO, M., BURKE, K., & AGUAYO, V. 2018.
  "International perspectives and trends in research on inclusive education: A systematic review". International Journal of Inclusive Education. Pp. 1-19. UK.
- FLORIAN, L. 2014. "What counts as evidence of inclusive education?" European Journal of Special Needs Education. Vol. 29, N° 3: 286-294. UK.
- GARANINA, Z., BALYAEV, S., & IONOVA, M. 2019. "The Role of Self-Attitude in the Personal and Professional Development of High School Students". The Education and science journal. Vol. 21, Nº 1: 82-96. USA.
- GIBSON, S. 2015. "When rights are not enough: What is? Moving towards new pedagogy for inclusive education within UK universities". International Journal of Inclusive Education. Vol. 19, N° 8: 875-886. USA.

- GORDON, J. 2013. "Is inclusive education a human right?" **The** Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics. Vol. 41, N° 4: 754-767. USA.
- HARDY, I., & WOODCOCK, S. 2015. "Inclusive education policies: Discourses of difference, diversity and deficit". International Journal of Inclusive Education. Vol. 19, N° 2: 141-164. UK.
- HASAN, M., HALDER, U., & DEBNATH, D. 2018. "Inclusive Education and Education for All. IJRAR". International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews. Vol. 5, N° 3: 2348–1269. UK.
- HONG, B. 2015. "Qualitative analysis of the barrier's college students with disabilities experience in higher education". Journal of College Student Development. Vol. 56, N° 3: 209-226. UK.
- LJUSBERG, A. 2011. "The structured classroom". International journal of inclusive education. Vol. 15, N<sup>o</sup> 2: 195-210. UK.
- MESSIOU, K. 2017. "Research in the field of inclusive education: time for a rethink?" **International Journal of Inclusive Education**. Vol. 21, N° 2: 146-159. UK.
- MILES, S., & SINGAL, N. 2010. "The Education for All and inclusive education debate: conflict, contradiction or opportunity?" International journal of inclusive education. Vol. 14, N° 1: 1-15. USA.
- ROMANOVA, G.A. 2017. "The development of the inclusive educational environment of university." **Bulletin of RMAT**. Vol. 4: 55-59. Russia.



Őn Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales

Año 36, Especial N° 26 (2020)

Esta revista fue editada en formato digital por el personal de la Oficina de Publicaciones Científicas de la Facultad Experimental de Ciencias, Universidad del Zulia. Maracaibo - Venezuela

www.luz.edu.ve

www.serbi.luz.edu.ve

produccioncientifica.luz.edu.ve